

**Concordia University
Council of the John Molson School of Business
Minutes of the meeting held
Friday, January 31, 2003**

Present: J. Tomberlin (Chair)
A. Ahmad (Fina.), J. Ahmad (Econ.), K. Argheyd (Mana.), C. Bayne (DS&MIS),
H. Bhabra (Fina.), S. Bognar (Mana.), B. K. Buyukkurt (Mktg.), R. Chandra
(Mktg.), D. Doreen (DS&MIS), C. Draimin (Acco.), R. Ferguson (MBA),
G. Fisher (Econ.), M. Genova (Staff), M. Gowing (Acco.), A. Guindon (Lib.),
A. B. Ibrahim (Assoc Dean), J. E. Jans (SGS), G. Kanaan (Assoc. Dean), D. Kira
(DS&MIS), M. R. Kapoor (Acco.), M. Magnan (Assoc. Dean), W. A. Merhi
(CGSA), D. Morin (Assoc. Dean), R. J. Oppenheimer (Mana.), N. Padden
(TESL), D. Peltier-Rivest (Acco.), S. Ray (Mktg.), P. Regimbald (Reg.), A. Robin
(CASA), S. Robinson (Acco.), C.A. Ross (Mktg.), M. Sharma (DS&MIS),
C. Y. Suen (Comp.Sci.), L. Switzer (Fina.)

Regrets: R. Knitter (Mana.), F. Nebebe (DS&MIS),

I Call to Order
The meeting was called to order at 09:35.

II Closed Meeting

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

III Open Meeting

IV Approval of Agenda - JMSB-2003-01A

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by D. Morin that Council approve the agenda as presented. The motion was carried unanimously.

V Approval of the Minutes - JMSB-2002-06M

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by S. Bognar that Council approve the minutes of the meeting held November 22, 2002 as presented. The motion was carried unanimously.

VI Chair's Report and Question Period JMSB-2003-01A-03 (maximum 15 minutes)

The Chair welcomed Professor Nina Padden and announced that the formal launch of the Concordia Chair in Organizational Development held by Professor Steven H. Appelbaum would take place on February 27, 2003.

The Chair announced that the JMSB has been awarded a \$750,000 grant from Valorisation-Recherche Québec (VRQ) exclusively for the production of on-line training courses for a paying customer. Having reviewed previous proposals from the AMBA the VRQ invited their proposal for on-line training development. The first client is Air Canada that will pay approximately \$750,000 for the delivery of the on-line training to their mid-management staff. Based on the success of this project, the grant provides for additional funding for paying clients such as the Cree. A formal signing ceremony with the VRQ will be scheduled in a few weeks. In the meantime work will begin with Air Canada. He reported that the VRQ was setting up a node in Montreal on the Global Development Learning network, established by the World Bank for the development of related training world-wide, that will be linked into the Québec inter-educational institution system. This would allow the JMSB to feed into the system and distribute via high-speed inter-net connections to the world.

During the question period, the achievement of JMSB student Dave Aiken, who was on the Dean's Honor list and selected as first team defensive half-back by the Canadian Intercollegiate Athletic Union, was recognized. It was noted that the student who placed sixth in Québec in the Uniform Final Exams of the Order of Chartered Accountants was a member of the Accountancy Co-op program.

JMSB-2003-01M

In response to a question about the existence of a building committee, the Chair agreed that in hindsight it would have been better to have established a building committee. However, given the continuous sense of urgency to develop the building program, the teaching space became a priority and the Teaching Space Committee was struck. The composition of the committee is: J. Tomberlin, D. Doreen, M. Magnan, B. Ibrahim, G. Johns, and A. Ahmad. With regard to providing faculty and staff members with a copy of the building plan for their feedback, the Chair advised that as soon as the revisions have been made to reduce the cost estimate by \$10M while at the same time ensuring adequate teaching and operating space, the plan will be distributed. There will then be a one-month time limit for consultation with JMSB employees.

With regard to a question about the process for Research Chair and Distinguished Professorship appointments, J. Tomberlin stated that the process for selection that had been approved by Council had been implemented for all appointments.

VII Council Elections

VIII Business Arising from Previous Meeting

i) Revised Aviation MBA Report - JMSB-2003-01A-04

D. Doreen reported a successful year with increased enrolment. With regard to the VRQ grant, he reported that the \$750,000 was likely the "tip of the iceberg". He advised that the second Aviation Management Education and Research Conference (AMERC) would be held this summer. This is a follow-up on the conference on air transport liberalization that the AMBA is co-hosting with ICAO, McGill Aerospace Law Institute, IATA, and ACI in March.

D. Doreen attributed the deficit to the after effect of 9/11 on the aviation industry. At the same time, the exclusive alliance with IATA was ending. To assure the survival of the program and develop relationships with diverse sectors of the aviation industry, advertising and promotional efforts were accelerated. As a result new alliances have been formed with ICAO, ACI, CANSO and IBAC and the enrolment is diversified with representation from airports, air navigational services, manufacturers and suppliers. Plans to reduce the deficit within the next two years include reducing costs by encouraging students in the full-time AMBA program to transfer to the GAMBA program, offering generic MBA courses through the Professional MBA program, exploring opportunities with interested schools to combine aviation specific MBA courses from the JMSB with credits from the home university, offering aviation specific courses to students who already have MBAs and increasing the tuition to \$28,000 U.S.

D. Doreen was asked what portion of the program was aviation specific. He estimated that approximately 50% of the program was aviation specific. Some

courses were totally aviation oriented while generic MBA courses were modified to focus on aviation issues.

With reference to the AMBA report presented at last the meeting of Council, one member of Council stated that it appeared as though a senior faculty member attempted to mislead Council by submitting a report for 2002 that contained 95% of the information submitted in the 2001 AMBA report to Council. Given that the Faculty teaches ethics, he stated that it was disturbing this conduct would be accepted by members of Council. He stated that he found this conduct unacceptable and that he felt that the Director of the AMBA Program should, at least, apologize to members of Council. He invited members of Council to consider this issue.

The Chair cautioned that this was a serious allegation. He asked that members of Council focus on the contents of the revised report.

In response to a question about eliminating the laptops to decrease expenses, D. Doreen stated that it would be problematic because the GAMBA students need a common platform. This step would neither enhance the reputation of the JMSB nor improve the financial outlook of the program.

A member of Council stated that he shared the concerns expressed by his colleague concerning the report submitted to Council at the November meeting. He requested an apology from the Director of the AMBA program.

The Chair reiterated his request that discussion be limited to the report. He asked that the issue of the November AMBA report be discussed at another time.

D. Doreen was asked how the decision to merge the full-time program with the GAMBA program would be made. He advised that the decision would be made based on low enrolment in the 2003-04 program – an enrolment of approximately 22 students would be the break even point.

A second member of Council endorsed the concerns of his two colleagues regarding the November 22nd AMBA report.

D. Doreen was asked if the AMBA program hired faculty to teach in the program. He confirmed that hiring was done by the departments. It was also confirmed that, similar to the reports from other privatized programs, the director's stipend and the university overhead were not included in the budget report. D. Doreen was asked why the decision to fold the full-time program was being delayed inasmuch as the AMBA program has had an average annual deficit of

approximately \$100,000. How long would money be invested in a program that does not show a profit? Could D. Doreen provide a budget projection based on real expectations rather than based on what happened last year? He replied that it would be inappropriate to close the full-time program at a time when its success has been rewarded with an external grant and an action plan was in place to reduce the deficit. It was pointed out that the AMBA program was in the midst of the appraisal process and the appropriate time for decision-making would be following the submission of the final appraisal report.

One member of Council expressed his sadness with the lack of collegiality in a discussion that attacks an individual. The revised report conveys information that reflects an industry that is suffering severe setbacks. While the short-term and long-term prospects are uncertain, the transportation industry remains a significant sector in the Canadian economy. He commented that one of the major benefits of the program has been the opportunity for faculty to teach and supplement their incomes.

With regard to a question about student loans guaranteed by Concordia, D. Doreen agreed to provide the faculty member with the number of students who have benefited from the \$300,000 in loans. As to the risk involved for Concordia, he reported a \$12,000 loss last year due to a student reneging on payment. Students who do not pay their loans do not receive their degrees.

A member of Council read a statement from an IATA report regarding IATA's alliances with McGill and Cranfield in the U.K. to offer an MBA with a specialization in aviation. He asked D. Doreen why IATA was working with McGill after an eight-year relationship with Concordia. D. Doreen replied that joining the consortium had been carefully considered. It was decided that the JMSB would not participate in a difficult and unprofitable venture due to concerns about starting an English aviation program in China in a school that does not meet AACSB standards.

In response to a question about the profitability of the conferences hosted by the AMBA, D. Doreen reported that last year's conference broke even and it was expected that the 2003 conference would break even as well.

The Chair asked for a motion to receive the report.

Objection was raised about Council not taking any action about the perception of dishonesty related to the submission of the AMBA report to the November Council meeting.

It was moved by C. A. Ross and seconded by C. Drimin that Council request an apology from the Director of the AMBA Program, D. Doreen.

It was cautioned that it would be difficult to prove the intent to deceive. The first report made to Council was rejected and the director revised the report as requested. One member of Council requested clarification as to what the director was to apologize for. Due process had not been followed with regard to the allegation that the director deliberately tried to mislead Council nor did the director have an opportunity to defend himself or discuss the issue with CUFA. She stated that she would not pursue this issue advising that there may be serious repercussions on the individuals who made this allegation that borders on slander. One member of Council argued that Council should acknowledge that it was contrary to appropriate behavior, particularly in an academic milieu, to submit the same report for two different years. It was also argued that it was inappropriate for Council to personalize issues and make judgments on an individual's behaviour. Issues of unethical behaviour must be dealt with in some other forum.

M. Sharma moved that Council receive the AMBA report, document JMSB-2003-01A-04

It was pointed out that there was a motion on the floor. *The mover and the seconder agreed to withdraw the motion.*

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by S. Bognar that Council receive the AMBA report, document JMSB-2003-01A-04.

The motion was carried (9 in favor, 0 opposed, 23 abstentions)

In response to a question about what happens with the AMBA program now, the Chair advised that Council will discuss the final report when the AMBA appraisal process has been completed.

D. Doreen was invited to comment on the allegation that he tried to mislead Council.

D. Doreen stated that under no circumstances did he consciously try to deceive his colleagues about this program and anything else he had been involved in over the last thirty years. The report contained some of the same information as the year before because he purposely takes the same report each year and adds to it to allow new members of Council to familiarize themselves with the historical background of the program. This has been done every year since the reports to Council were initiated. Moreover, repetition would likely be found in other program reports as well. The thirty pages laid it all on the table. There was no deception. As requested by Council the thirty-page document was reduced to four pages to conform to the reports of the other privatized programs. He stated that it

was unfortunate that the Council would discuss an issue regarding ethical standards without following proper procedures.

- ii) **Executive Development Programs update – JMSB-2003-01A-05**
M. Magnan was asked the process for involving faculty members in the program. He advised that up until now the courses offered were mostly operations and methods management and faculty members were not involved. Future plans include offering business courses in line with faculty expertise to encourage faculty participation. With regard to process, he advised that the EDP Steering Committee members, W. Taylor, S. Appelbaum and K. Boulos, were developing criteria for the course offerings based on market demand. Once the courses have been chosen faculty with relevant expertise and executive teaching experience would be invited to apply. In some cases, the client may demand that the course be given by a specific instructor. The Steering Committee would vet all faculty appointments.

M. Magnan noted an error on the second to last page of the report: Direct Expenses – Actual 2002 - should read \$263,000 instead of \$474,500.2002.

M. Magnan was congratulated on the comprehensive presentation of the budget. It was suggested that all privatized programs follow this format.

In response to a comment that one would not expect more than a break even from a program of this nature, M. Magnan stated that after reviewing the performance of other executive programs, the goal was to show a 15 – 20% net profit margin. In the past there was not enough effort to reach the customized seminar market and the mechanisms employed to reach clients were inefficient. These issues are being addressed by the Director, K. Boulos.

It was suggested that the low rate of repeat business be investigated.

M. Magnan was asked if the program was market-driven. He replied that historically the program operated by responding to calls. A pro-active approach is now in effect where sales calls are being made to contacts to find out if and how we can meet their training needs.

- iii) **Review of Criteria for the Selection of Prize Winners**
G. Kanaan informed Council members that the document would be ready for the next meeting of Council.

IX Report: Graduate Programs, Research and Program Evaluation - JMSB-2003-01A-06

D. Morin invited questions or comments regarding her report to Council. One member of council expressed concern about the distribution of the details of the Joe Kelly Graduate Award. D. Morin advised that the Office of the Associate Dean, Graduate Programs, Research and Program Evaluation would develop the procedures for selection. She confirmed that the examination and ranking of the submissions would be handled by the Faculty Research Committee.

With regard to the enrolment statistics, she explained that there was strong competition for the Graduate Diploma in e-Business from programs that do not require the GMAT for admission. The program director is investigating ways to attract high caliber students to the program. As to the DIA/DSA decline, C. Bayne stated that the decline was cyclical in nature. It is expected that the enrolment for fall, winter and summer would balance with last year's enrolment.

With regard to the inaccessible technological equipment in GM403-2 and GM302, one member of Council described an embarrassing scene during a recent visiting speaker event attended by many internal and external guests. The Chair explained that the technological equipment installed in GM403-2 and GM302 was purchased by the Graduate Program in Investment Management. Experience has shown that when the equipment was available to everyone, it broke down and was inoperable for the essential business it was designated for – teleconferencing for the Graduate Program in Investment Management. Consequently, the equipment was for the sole use of the GPIM program

The Director of CIT advised that equipment would be ordered for the two rooms. The GPIM equipment will continue to be restricted for use by the program staff but there will be other equipment permanently in place in GM403-2 and GM302 for other users of the facilities. It was clarified that "wired" does not necessarily mean that equipment is in place.

D. Morin agreed with the comment that the number of students charged with misconduct against the Code of Conduct, Academic had increased. She noted, however, that many of the charges were dropped after discussion with the professor and student involved. It was remarked that the process was problematic. In some cases, faculty members, intimidated by students, were reluctant to file complaints.

D. Morin agreed to provide a breakdown of the M.Sc. and Ph.D. admissions according to discipline at the next meeting of Council. It was suggested that additional details about winter admissions would help with program recruitment. Information such as what was missing from the incomplete files could generate ideas as to how the program staff can help prospective students to complete the application process.

X CGSA Report

W. Merhi reported the success of the Christmas party and advised the Chinese New Year party would be sponsored in part by the Chinese Chamber of Commerce. All faculty and

students were invited. Following-up on last semester's student vs faculty soccer win the MBA students are challenging the faculty to a hockey game this semester. He advised that the MBA Case Competition award was sponsored by a donation of \$2,000 and that details concerning the introduction of a new Graduate Award in the amount of \$1,000 would be presented at the next meeting of Council. In closing, he invited everyone to attend the next MBA Speakers Series on February 13th.

XI Report: External Affairs and Executive Programs
There was no report.

XII Report: Administrative Affairs and Human Resources
B. Ibrahim reported that the Manager of GM building would attend the next meeting of Council to address the concerns of Council members.

XIII Report: Undergraduate Programs, Academic and Student Affairs – JMSB-2003-01A-07
G. Kanaan reported an increase in winter admissions by eleven students noting that the composition differs from last January with more international students and less from local CEGEPs. With regard to discipline choice, he noted that accounting, finance and international business were in high demand.

The high rate of incomplete application files was attributed to the many students who apply on-line without any commitment to paying the admission fee or following up with the required documentation.

XIV Reports from School Representatives on University Committees

i) University Senate	There was no report.
ii) Arts and Science Faculty Council	There was no report.
iii) Senate Academic Planning and Priorities	There was no report.
iv) Senate Academic Programs Committee	There was no report.
v) Senate Research Committee	There was no report.
vi) University Library Committee	There was no report.
vii) Undergraduate Scholarships and Awards Sub-committee	There was no report.
viii) Board of Governors	There was no report.
ix) Council of the School of Graduate Studies	

J. Jans announced that T. Stathopoulos has been appointed Associate Dean, School of Graduate Studies. His responsibilities will include curriculum, appraisals and awards. He advised that the deadline for Fellowship applications was January 25th.

XV CASA Report
A. Robin highlighted the contents of the CASA report (JMSB-2003-01M-01) that was distributed to Council members.

XVI New Business

XVII Other Business

XVIII Adjournment

*It was moved by H. Bhabra and seconded by C. Bayne that the meeting be adjourned.
The motion was carried unanimously.*

The meeting was adjourned at 12:15.

XIX Next meeting

The next regular meeting of Council will take place on Friday, March 7, 2003 in room GM302.